BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084629 4

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

VOLUME 2

September 1984

LAW LIBRARY
SEP 7 1984
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

VOLUME 2

September 1984

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/employmentlaw02lang_0

E M P L O Y M E N T L A W

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. VALUES AND PHILOSOPHY 1

A. Introduction 1

Fuller and Perdue, "The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages" 1
A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism About Nominalism" 1

B. Work and Employment 2

Braverman, Labour and Monopoly Capital 2
Heilbroner, The Making of Economic Society 4
Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity" 9

C. Standards of Evaluation 15

(i) Introduction 15

(ii) The Market Model 16

Alchain and Allen, University Economics 16
Gunderson, Economics of Poverty and Income Distribution 17
Thurow, Generating Inequality 19

(iii) Normative Defences and Critiques 22

Friedman, Capitalism and Freedom 22
Posner, The Economics of Justice 24
Rawls, A Theory of Justice 26
Scanlon, "Liberty, Contract and Contribution" 27
MacPherson, "Elegant Thombstones: A Note on Friedman's Freedom" 28
Weber, "Freedom and Coercion 29
Smith, The Wealth of Nations 31
Alchain and Allen, University Economics 31
Braverman, Labour and Monopoly Capital 31
Nozick, Anarchy State and Utopia 34
Tuohy & Trebilcock, Policy Options in the Regulation of Asbestos-Related Health Hazards 37

(iv) Regulation: Defences and Critiques 40

Ostry and Zaidi, Labour Economics in Canada 40
Posner, Economic Analysis of Law 43

Beatty, "Ideology, Unionism and Politics" 44
Weiler, "Promises to Keep: Securing Workers' Rights to Self-Organization Under the NLRA" 49
Weiler, Reconcilable Differences 51
Beatty, "Ideology, Politics and Unionism" 52
Klare, "Labour Law as Ideology: Toward a New Historiography of Collective Bargaining Law" 54
Nagel, "Libertarianism Without Foundations" 58
Kennedy, "The Structure of Blackstone's Commentaries" 59

D. Questions 61

E. The Contract/Status Debate 62

Polyani, The Great Transformation 63

F. Contractual Analysis 64

Christie, Employment Law in Canada 64
Arthurs, Carter & Glasbeek, Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada 64
Freedland, The Contract of Employment 64
McNeil, "The Many Futures of Contract" 67
Fox, Beyond Contract: Work, Power and Trust Relations 75

II. THE SEARCH FOR THE "ESSENCE" OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP AND THE ANSWER TO THE QUESTION "IS THIS PERSON AN EMPLOYEE? 78

A. General 78

Introduction 78
Kahn-Freund, Note 80
Davis and Freedland, Labour Law: Text and Materials 80
Ready Mixed Concrete v. Min. of Pensions and National Insurance 81
Mayer v. J. Conrad Lavigne Ltd. 84

B. Status Under Labour Standards Legislation 89

1. The General Problem 89

Re Becker Milk Co. 90
Re Becker Milk Co. (Div.Ct.) 97
Salvation Army Sheltered Workshop and Kaszuba 98

2. Exclusions 104

Comcare v. Ambrose 105

C. The Importance of Avoiding Formalism 107

Wittgenstein, Philosophical Investigations 107
NLRB v. Hearst Publications 109
Ontario Labour Relations Act 116
Denham v. Midland Employers' Mutual Assurance Ltd. 116
T.L.A. v. M.E.A.

III HIRING 122

A. Introduction 122

Freedland, The Contract of Employment 122
Courtright v. Canadian Pacific Railway 126

B. Discrimination in Hiring 135

Posner, The Economics of Justice 135
Dworkin, Taking Rights Seriously 139
Fallon, "To Each According to his Ability, From None According to his Race: The Concept of Merit in Anti-Discrimination Law" 144

1. The Common Law 149

a) Bd. of Governors of Seneca College v. Bhadauria 149

2. Statutes 158

a) Griggs v. Duke Power Co. 158
b) Note 163
c) Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Simpson-Sears Ltd. (Div.Ct.) 175
d) Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Simpson-Sears Ltd. (C.A.) 175
e) Statistical Evidence

(i) Sullivan, Zimmer and Richard, Federal Statutory Law of Employment Discrimination 177
(ii) Re Windsor Board of Education 191
(iii) Dothard v. Rawlinson 205

3. The Constitution 216

a) Corwin, The Constitution and What it Means Today 216

4. Affirmative Action 218

a) Athabasca Tribal Council v. Amoco (Alta. C.A.) 218
b) Re Athabasca Tribal Council and Amoco (S.C.C.) 237
c) United Steelworkers of America v. Weber (U.S. S.C.) 241
d) Connecticut v. Teal (U.S. S.C.) 247

IV. THE CONTENT OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP (EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS) 254

Introduction 255

Fox, Beyond Contract: Work, Power and Trust Relationships 255

A. Express Obligations and Their Variation 256

Peerless Laundry v. Neal 256
Hill v. Peter Gorman 259
K.M.A. Catering v. Howie 271
Campbell v. MacMillan Bloedel Ltd. 274

B. Restrictive Covenants 275

Nordenfelt v. Maxim Nordenfelt 275
M.S. Drapers v. Reynolds 275
Christie, Employment Law in Canada 277
Kores Manufacturing v. Kolok Manufacturing 280

C. An Aside About Pensions and their Regulation 286

1. Types of Pensions

Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers"

2. Legislative Initiatives 289

a) Regulation of Private Plans 289

(i) Christie, Employment Law in Canada 289
(ii) Ontario Pension Benefits Act 291
(iii) Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers" 292

b) The Canada Pension Plan and Old Age Security Pension 293

(i) Archur, Carter and Glasbeek, Labour Law 294
(ii) Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers" 295

3. Pensions and Discrimination 296

a) City of Los Angeles v. Manhart 296
b) Schweiker, "Insurance by Gender" 303
c) Arizona Governing Committee v. Norris 304

D. A Note About Implied Obligations in General 314

Christie, Employment Law in Canada 314

E. Competence 321

Cassidy v. Ministry of Health 321
Lister v. Romford Ice & Cold Storage Co. 327
Sealand of the Pacific 332
D.H. Overmeyer v. Wallace Transfer 333
Janata Bank v. Ahmed 336
Reiter, "Contracts, Torts, Relations and Reliance" 341

F. Fidelity, Inventions, Competition, Trade Secrets, Confidential Information, Fiduciary Obligations and Bribes 349

Robb v. Green 349
State Vacuum Stores v. Phillips 350
Triplex Safety Glass v. Scorah 356
W.J. Gage v. Sugden 359
Spiroll Corp. v. Putti 363
Christie, Employment Law in Canada 364
Reading v. Attorney General 368
Canadian Aero Service v. O'Malley

V. Termination

A. Introduction 386

Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity" 386
Swinton, "Contract Law and the Employment Relationship" 389

B. Expiration of a Fixed Term and Agreed Periods of Notice 393

The Employment Standards Act 393
Christie, Employment Law in Canada 393
Re Christopher and CKXM-FM 399
Nordocchio v. CIBC 405

C. Retirement 421

Employment Standards Act Regulations 421
Bell Canada v. OPSEIU 421

D. Firing 426

1. Termination with Due Notice or Pay in Lieu 426

(a) The Common Law 426

(i) Bardal v. The Globe & Mail 426
(ii) Bohemier v. Storwal International (H.C.) 432
(iii) Bohemier v. Storwal International (C.A.) 436
(iv) Red Deer College v. Michaels 437
(v) Harris, Wrongful Dismissal 441
(vi) McDonald v. Swift Canadian Co. 444

(b) Remedies for Wrongful Dismissal 445

(i) Quantum and Heads of Damage 445

(a) Pilon v. Peugot 445
(b) Bohemier v. Storwal International (H.C.) 449
(c) Bohemier v. Storwal International (C.A.) 454
(d) Wilcox and Marshall v. G.W.G. 454
(e) Brown v. Waterloo Regional Board of Commissioners of Police 462
(f) Pilato v. Hamilton Place Convention Centre 468

(ii) Specific Performance 474

(a) De Francesco v. Barnum 474
(b) Hill v. C.A. Parsons 475
(c) Warner Bros. Pictures v. Nelson 487

2. Summary Dismissal; Dismissal With Cause 495

(a) Christie, Employment Law in Canada 495
(b) Laws v. London Chronicle 503

3. Quitting, Constructive Dismissal (Quitting for Cause) and Variation 506

Christie, Employment Law in Canada 506
Thomas Marshall Exports v. Guinle 509
Gould v. Hermes Electronics 517
Baker v. Burns Foods Ltd. 529
Wallace v. Toronto-Dominion Bank 531
Longman v. Federal Business Development Bank 547
Peerless Laundry v. Neal 560
Hill v. Peter Gorman 560

4. A Pause for Reflection 561

Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity" 562
Cohen, "The Relationship of Contractual Remedies to Political and Social Status: A Preliminary Inquiry 578

5. Natural Justice and the Duty of Fairness 588

Ridge v. Baldwin 588
Re Nicholson and Haldinand-Norfolk Regional Board 593
Robson v. General Motors 603
Pulsifer v. GTE Sylvania Canada Ltd. 608

6. Discipline 613

Hanley v. Pease & Partners Ltd. 613
McGavin Toastmaster v. Ainscough 614
Adams, Grievance Arbitration of Discharge Cases 620

7. Frustration 629

Employment Standards Act 629
Christie, Employment Law In Canada 629
Ottoman Bank v. Chakarian 635
O'Connell v. Harkema Express Lines 640
Question 651

8. Employer Going Out of Business 652

Nokes v. Doncaster Amalgamated Collieries 652
Christie, Employment Law in Canada 652
Addison v. McLock Ltd. 661

9. Statutory Regulation of Discipline and Discharge 664

1. Introduction 664

2. Unjust Dismissal Statutes 665

England, "Recent Developments in Wrongful Dismissal Laws and Some Pointers for Reform" 665
Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity" 667
The Canada Labour Code 668
Roberts v. Bank of Nova Scotia 671
Pepin v. Okanagan Broadcasters Ltd. 677

10. Redundancy 681

a) At Common Law 681

Baker v. Burns Foods Ltd. 681

b) Statutory Regulation 682

1. Introduction

The Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Redundancies and Layoffs (The Carrothers Commission) 682

2. Traditional Responses 688

Christie, Employment Law in Canada 689
Rolph, "Notice Requirements, Termination and Severance Pay Under Ontario's Employment Standards Act" 691
Re Ontario Employment Standards Act 693
T.W.U. v. British Columbia Telephone Co. 695
Re Freightliner of Canada and C.A.I.M.A.W. 698
Town of Yarmouth v. Manser 702

3. Beyond Notice and Severance Pay 704

Ontario Employment Standards Act 704
Rolph, "Notice Requirements, Termination and Severance Pay Under Ontario's Employment Standards Act" 704
Ryder, "Developing the Rights of Redundant Workers: A Zero-Sum Industrial Society 706
Canada Labour Code 707
Adams, "The Unorganized: A Rising Force" 709
Beatty, "Ideology, Politics, Unionism" 710

11. Prohibited Dismissals 712

a) Age Discrimination 712

OHRC v. Borough of Etobicoke 712
Tuohy v. Ford Motor Co. 722

b) Sexual Harassment 723

Cox v. Super Great Submarine 723
Kotyle v. Canadian Employment and Immigration Commission 732
MacKinnon, Sexual Harassment of Working Women: A Case of Sex Discrimination 736

12. Third Party Liability for Dismissals 752

Nicholls v. Corporation of Township of Richmond 752

VI. HEALTH AND SAFETY: SELECTED PROBLEMS 755

1. Self-Help 755

a) The Right to Know 755

Note, "Occupational Health Risks and the Workers' Right to Know" 756
Swinton, "Enforcement of Occupational Health and Safety Legislation" 763

b) The Right to Refuse Unsafe Work 767

Re Steel Co. of Canada and U.S.W. 767
Swinton, "Enforcement of Occupational Health and Safety Legislation" 773
Problem 781

2. Health and Safety and Sex Discrimination 782

Howard, "Hazardous Substances in the Workplace" 782
Advisory Memorandum 81-I to the Minister of Labour 787
Exploring the Biomedical Interface Between OSHA and Title VII 798

VII. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT AND COLLECTIVE BARGAINING 799

J.I. Case Co. v. N.L.R.B. 799
Re Telegraph Publishing Co. v. Zwelling 804

Downey v. Scotia Square Hotel 813
Brunet v. General Motors 817
Problem 818

VIII. CONSTITUTIONAL DIVISION OF POWERS 819

1. A B.C. Trilogy 819

Arrow Transfer 819
Westcoast Transmission 824
Canadian Telephone and Supplies 828

2. A Farther Problem 832

Railway Clerks and Marathon Realty 832
Problem 836

3. And Yet Another Problem 837

Employment Standards Board v. Evans 837

IX. PAY 844

A. The Common Law Obligation to Pay 844

1. The Entire Contract Doctrine 844

La Plante v. Kinnon 844
Christie, Employment Law in Canada 845

2. Sick Employees 845

Dartmouth Ferry v. Marks 845
Note
Marx, Das Kapital 851
Risley, "An Introduction to the Position of the Sick Employee in Nova Scotia" 856

B. Minimum Wages and Other Labour Standards 869

1. Introduction 869

2. Minimum Wage 869

West & McKee, Minimum Wages 871
Hum, Federalism and the Poor 877

Christie, Employment Law in Canada 879
Domestic Workers' Union v. A.G.R.C. 880

3. Regulation of Hours of Work and Overtime 884

Christie, Employment Law in Canada 884
Falconbridge Nickle Mines Ltd. 889
Westeel Roscoe v. U.S.W. 897

4. Other Labour Standards 900

5. Recovery of Unpaid Pay 901

Procedures Under the Employment Standards Act 901
Annual Report: 1981-82 901
Re Downing and Graydon 902

6. Actual Recovery - Insolvencies and Priorities 912

a) Christie, Employment Law in Canada 912

b) In Ontario 912

Employment Standards Act 914
Trebilcock, Laskin, Reiter, Debtor and Creditor 920
Toronto Star 922
Toronto Globe and Mail 923
Statement to the Legislature 924

c) Statutory Trusts 925

The Employment Standards Act 925
Re Pheonix Paper Products Ltd. 925

d) Statutory Lien on Charge 935

Homeplan Realty v. Avco 935

C. Equal Pay 937

1. The Problem 937

Armstrong & Armstrong, The Double Ghetto: Canadian Women and Their Segregated Work 937

2. Legislative Responses 953

a) In Ontario 953

The Employment Standards Act 953
Billing v. Derouin Opticians Ltd. (Fraser) 954
Derouin Optician Ltd. v. Fraser (S.C.) 977
Bill 141 979

b) In Canada 980

The Canadian Human Rights Act 980

3. Avenues of Redress 982

Cosnell v. Pfizer 982
AFSCME v. State of Washington 984
Letter Re: AFSCME case 993
Krauthammer, "From Bad to Worth" 999
Ontario Human Rights Code 1002
Toronto Star 1002

4. Analysis 1003

Gunderson, "The Male-Female Earnings Gap in Ontario" 1003
Armstrong and Armstrong 1008